

**UNDERSTANDING PROBLEMS OF LOCAL BODY MEMBERS IN
DISTRICT DIR LOWER, KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PAKISTAN**

Lal Zaman

Graduate Student, Department of Sociology, University of Malakand

&

Dr Arab Naz

Department of Sociology, University of Malakand

Abstract

This paper aims to analyze and understand the various problems faced by local body members in District Dir Lower, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Pakistan. The population for the current study was 2244 elected local body members while a sample of 70 elected members were selected from the whole District through convenient sample technique. The data has been analyzed with the help of SPSS version 20 and is classified, analyzed and presented in the form of tables, frequency, percentages and discussion over tables has been made. Similarly, the tables have been judged through chi-square application with confidence level of .05%, as well as through correlation technique. The analysis shows that the most of the local body members were not aware about their role and responsibilities and the local body system. The reasons were the lack of awareness, lack of access to media regarding local body system and lack of understanding about the concept and working relations. The study recommends that the provincial government should support and release funds to local level and fulfills all the necessary requirements on priority basis.

Keywords: *Problem; Provincial; Bureaucrats; Awareness; Infrastructure; Fund; Representation*

1.1. BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

Pakistan is a federal republic including the provinces of Sindh, Punjab, Baluchistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP). In addition to these four provinces, the country has federally administrated tribal Areas (FATA), Gilgit-Baltistan (GB), Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK). Federalism imagines separation of political power territorially in a legitimate way in which every portion of the federation is viewed as a unitary state with its own internal structure of local government (Smith, 1985). In current literature, the concept of unitary state has been substituted with independent state with more weight to changing governance mechanisms. Devolution to local governments is referred to as one of the four major forms of Decentralization (Mathur, 1983). The other three being de-concentration, delegation to semi-autonomous agencies and transfer of functions from public to non-government establishments. Decentralization of power implies assignment of authority to sub-national governments electorally answerable to the sub-national populations (Turner & Hulme, 1997). Pakistan's history is checked with political instability and frequent administrative changes. While independence movement was driven by political party mobilizations at the grassroots level, however, post-independence, there was little emphasis on local governments. The limited scope and authority of local governments that existed were controlled and superseded by the central bureaucracy by not holding elections and where elections were held, by limited franchise and massive malpractices (Waseem M., 2007). During the decade of the 1950s, weakening of local governments coincided with increased centralization and a center was increasingly dominated by the interdependent nexus forged between the civil and military bureaucracy (Jalal, 1995).

Politically, centralizing factors strengthened due to numerous changes in governments including four main military coups and wars with India in 1948, 1965 and 1971 that led

Pakistan to centralized decision-making mechanisms (Talbot, 2009). Essentials of welfare state dropped down and the political discourse was highly influenced by its security concerns. The three most significant decentralization reforms in the seven decades old history of Pakistan were introduced by rigid military regimes in 1959, 1979 and 2001 respectively. These systems had five stark similarities (Bhatti, 2013):

- i. Military governments installed all the three systems of local government in Pakistan.
- ii. First local body elections were held in the absence of any other opportunity of the elected government at provincial or federal levels.
- iii. Local government systems were incubated by the federal governments evading the provincial tier of governance.
- iv. Local government systems were deployed as a “ladder of legitimacy” by succeeding military governments.
- v. Local governments system was used as a tool to extend central authority of the federation to the district and local levels.

The 18th Amendment passed in April 2010 was hailed wide-ranging reform package after the passage of the 1973 Constitution. The aim was to repeal the 17th Amendment and to reform the Constitution in the light of the Charter of Democracy. The Charter provided the work-plan for the Parliamentary Committee for Constitutional Reforms (PCCR) (Waseem M. , 2010). The 18th Amendment has introduced important steps on the way to the decentralization of authority and enhancing provincial sovereignty. It removed the Concurrent Legislative List that was a bone of contention between the federation and the provinces. Article 140-A adopted in the constitution via the 18th Amendment specifies: “Each province shall, by law, establish

a local government system and devolve political, administrative and financial responsibility and authority to the elected representatives of the local government. (2) Elections to the local governments shall be held by the election commission of Pakistan.” Furthermore, the Article 32 of Principles of Policy asks the State to encourage local government institutions composed of elected representatives of the areas concerned and give special representation to minorities, peasants, workers and women in such institutions. Similarly, Article 37(i) calls for decentralization of government administration on the axis of expeditious disposal of business for convenience of people. Hence, the Constitution categorically defines four parameters for elected Local Government that it has to have political, administrative, financial and electoral responsibility and authority (Bhatti, 2013):

- i. Devolution of Political Responsibility and Authority: The political aspect corresponds to the regulative and policy related responsibilities and authorities to be devolved to the local government(s).
- ii. Devolution of Administrative Responsibility and Authority: The administrative aspect relates to executive responsibilities and authorities in the course of every-day functioning of the local government(s).
- iii. Devolution of Financial Responsibility and Authority: The fiscal component relates to the revenue and expenditure assignments of the local government(s).
- iv. Devolution of Responsibility and Authority to the Elected Representatives of Local Government: This component clearly establishes that the devolution of responsibilities and authorities of all the functions should be assigned to the elected representatives of the local government.

After the 18th amendment local body election has been held in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province on May 30 2015. The people took part in large number and having great expectation from the new local body system.

1.2. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

Prior to the 18th Amendment in the constitution of Pakistan, the provinces had been demanding autonomy from a powerful federation that had monopolized legislative, executive and financial powers. The amendment not only abolished the concurrent legislative list and devolved substantial powers to the provinces. It is also inserted Article 140-A that made devolution of political, administrative and authority to the local government mandatory (Shahab, 2015). Now the local governments want autonomy and resources from the provincial governments. But while part V of the constitution lays down an elaborate framework for the distribution of legislative, administrative and financial powers between the federal government and provinces, the constitution leaves it to the provincial legislatures to regulate relations with local governments (Usto, 2016). Interestingly, recognizing the significance of the local governments and anticipating the possible friction between them and the state on matters related to the distribution of powers, the Indian constitution provides a scheme on local body governments and state relation in part IX and IX-A. But in Pakistan have not received such significance. In fact, before 18th Amendment in the constitution of Pakistan, local governments were not mandatory, only desirable. Article 32 that only encourage the establishment of local government's institutions was not even justiciable, being part of the principle of policy (Majid, 2014). Moreover, the civilian government perceived local governments as a ploy that military rulers used to acquire a political base and representative character. But now, the local governments have constitutionally assumed the status of the third tier of the government. Provincial legislature can no more avoid a new and workable configuration of powers to

accommodate and enable local governments to perform their statutory functions and enjoy their constitutional mandate (Khan, 2014).

After the legislation in every province local body election has been held and in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa especially local governments has been formed. As compare to the previous local body government, there are also problems in the current local body system. Local body members facing many problems in the current system of local government. If the local body members solve their problems then society will be developed. The current study focuses on the level of knowledge of local body elected members regarding their role and responsibilities, to know about the problems faced by elected local body members from political parties and as well as to understand the problems faced by local body members from Provincial Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government.

1.3. OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

1. To Understand the Problems faced by Elected Members from the Provincial Government
2. To Analyze the level of understanding of the Elected Members Regarding their Role and Responsibilities

1.4. HYPOTHESIS OF THE STUDY

2. More Awareness of the Local Body Members better would be the Role and Responsibilities
3. More and more facilitation from the Government to Local Body Member leads to better Performance of Local Government

1.5. METHODOLOGY OF THE STUDY

The current study has been conducted in the District Dir Lower, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. The nature of the study is purely Quantitative. The total population of the study area was 1.544 Million. The targeted population for the current study remains 2244 which were Local body elected members of whole district Dir lower and a sample of 70 were selected through convenient sample technique. Researcher used structured Questionnaire as a tool of data collection in the process of collection of the data while the data has been analyzed with the help of SPSS version 20 in the form of tables with frequency, percentage, mean, mode and median while the table has been also tested with Chi-Square test with confidence level of .05%.

1.6. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1.6.1. Political Affiliations of the Respondents

The political party of the respondents is related variable and it is an important for the researcher to know about the number of representation of the parties in the local body government. In the research area there were various Political Parties and they took part in the previous local body elections which was held in May 2015 from every union council. The major parties i.e. Jamat e Islami (JI), Pakistan Tehreek e Insaf (PTI), Awami National Party (ANP), Pakistan People Party (PPP), Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz(PMLn), QaomiWattan party (QWP) and also some independent local body members on non-party basis the study area. The detail of party position is given below (See Table-1).

Table-1: The Political Affiliations of the Respondents

Political Party	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent	Mean	Median	Mode
Jamat-e-Islami	25	35.7	35.7			
Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf	15	21.4	57.1			
Pakistan People Party	10	14.3	71.4			
Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz	5	7.1	78.6	2.79	2.00	1
Qaomi-Wattan Party	5	7.1	85.7			
Awami National Party	5	7.1	92.9			
Independent	5	7.1	100.0			
Total	70	100.0				

The statistical information shows the Political Party of the respondents in which among the total of the field participants 25 (35.7%) respondents belonged to Jamat e Islami (JI), similarly 15 (21.4%) respondents were from Pakistan Tehreek e Insaf (PTI), 10 (14%) belonged to Pakistan people party (PPP), Pakistan Muslim league Nawaz (PMLn) 5 (7.1%), Awami National party (ANP) 5 (7.1%), while there were also the respondents of Qaomi Wattan Party (QWP) 5 (7.1%) and 5 (7.15%) respondents were independently contested elections. Majority of the respondents belonged to Jamat e Islami and they have hold on the district local government in the study area. The mean of the data is 2.79, Median is 2.00 and the mode of the data is 1.

1.6.2. Lack of Infrastructure in the Current Local Body System

The newly elected local body members were facing many problems but the most important problem is the lack of infrastructure for the local body members. They have no formal office to set there and listen the problems of community people or the local people where to complaint formally about their issues. Most of the local body members buy offices on rent paying from their own pocket money. The researcher asked from the respondents about the lack of infrastructure to know about the opinion of the filed participants. The various reasons of for lack of infrastructure have been discussed and presented in the Table-2.

Table-2: Lack of Infrastructure in the Current Local Body System

Reasons of lack of infrastructure	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent	Mean	Median	Mode
No	20	28.6	28.6			
Lack of funds	30	42.9	71.4			
Government is not interested	15	21.4	92.9	1.07	1.00	1
Bureaucratic hurdles	5	7.1	100.0			
Total	70	100.0				

The statistical analysis shows the result of the opinion of the respondents about the lack of infrastructure. In the research study the sample size was 70, in which 20 (28.6%) respondents were of the opinion that there is no problem of infrastructure while 50 (72.4%) respondents were of the views that there is lack of infrastructure. Among the 72.4% respondents 30 (42.9%) respondents stated that the main reason of lack of infrastructure is the lack of funds from the government, similarly 15 (21.4%) respondents were in the favor that the provincial

government is not interested to provide infrastructure relief to the elected members of local bodies while only 5 (7.1%) respondents marked that due to bureaucratic hurdles we have no infrastructure. The majority of the respondents (42.9%) stated that the lack of funds is the basic reason of lack of infrastructure. The mean of the above data is 1.07, 1.00 is the median of the data while the mode if the data is 1. The tabular data has been also tested with Chi-Square Test and the result of the test has been given in the mentioned table.

Results of the Chi-Square test

	Lack of infrastructure in the current local Government
Chi-Square	18.571 ^a
Df	3
Asymp. Sig.	.000

a. 0 cells (0.0%) have expected frequencies less than 5. The minimum expected cell frequency is 17.5.

Chi-Square test has been used to judge the association of variables. Test statistics chi-Square with value 18.571a, degree of freedom= 3 and with $p < 0.05$ shows that there is significance relations in the lack of infrastructure in the current local Government.

1.6.3. Bureaucratic Hurdles in the way of Local Body Members

According to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa local body Act 2013 section 11 sub sections 1 and 2, in every district, there shall be a district government which shall consist of a district council and district administration made up of the devolved offices. Executive Authority of district government shall vest in Nazim, district council and he/she shall be responsible to ensure that the business of the district government is carried out in accordance with this Act and other laws for the time being in force. So there is mixture of authority in the district government. On

one side there is elected representative of the people while on the other side there is bureaucrats like Assistant commissioner, deputy commissioner etc. In the previous local body government people observed the bureaucratic hurdles in the way of local bodies. The researcher also included the Question in the study about bureaucratic hurdles to judge the opinion of the respondents in this regard. The various hurdles from bureaucratic hurdles to local body members have been analyzed and presented in the Table-3.

Table-3: Bureaucratic Hurdles in the way of Local Body Members

Bureaucratic hurdles	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent	Mean	Median	Mode
No	15	21.4	21.4			
Not allowing to work properly	15	21.4	42.9			
Creating problems to local body members	15	21.4	64.3	1.79	2.00	3
Delay the work	20	28.6	92.9			
Not providing funds	5	7.1	100.0			
Total	70	100.0				

The table reflects the results of the opinion of the respondents regarding the bureaucratic hurdles in the way of local body members in the current system. In the results among the total numbers of sample size, 15 (21.4%) respondents were of the opinion that there is no bureaucratic hurdles in the current system while 55 (79.6%) were of the views that there is bureaucratic hurdles in the way of local body elected members. Among the 79.6%, 15 (21.4%) respondents believed that bureaucrats not allow the local bodies members to work properly, 15 (21.4%) respondents were of the opinion that the bureaucrats create problems to local body

members, among the sample size, 20 (28.6%) respondents agreed with the notion that the bureaucrats delay the work of local body members while only 5 (7.1%) respondents ticked not providing funds to local body members. Mean of the above data is 1.79, 2.00 is the median of the data while the mode of the data is 3 while the test statistics in the form of Chi-Square test has been used for the given data and the result of the test has been presented in the following table.

Test Statistics

	Bureaucratic hurdles in the way of local body members
Chi-Square	8.571 ^a
Df	4
Asymp. Sig.	.073

a. 0 cells (0.0%) have expected frequencies less than 5. The minimum expected cell frequency is 14.0.

The given test statistics i.e. chi-Square with value 8.571a, degree of freedom= 4 and with $p > 0.05$ shows that there is no significance relation in Bureaucratic hurdles in the way of local body members.

1.6.4. Reasons of Financial Constraints to Elected Local Body Members

According to the recent interview of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Minister for local bodies Mr. Inayat ullah khan with Aaj Newspaper on 20 March 2016, about 30% of total budget of development has been transfer to the district government and will release more funds to district level government. After local body elections everywhere, local bodies' members were on the roads to protest for authority and allocation of funds. Therefore, the researcher included Question

regarding the financial constraints in the study to know about the opinion of the respondents. The various reasons for financial constraint have analyzed and presented in the Table-4.

Table-4: Reasons of Financial Constraints to Elected Local Body Members

Reasons of financial constraints	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent	Mean	Median	Mode
No	15	21.4	21.4			
MNAs and MPAs do not want to transfer funds to local level	15	21.4	42.9			
Bureaucracy	5	7.1	50.0	2.36	2.50	4
Being part of opposition parties	5	7.1	57.1			
Provincial Government	25	35.7	92.9			
Political intervention	5	7.1	100.0			
Total	70	100.0				

The statistical data reveals the result of the opinion of the respondents regarding the reasons of financial constraints to local body elected members. Among the total numbers of respondents in the study, 15 (21.4%) respondents were of the opinion that there are no financial constraints while 55 (78.6%) respondents were of the views that there are financial constraints. Among the 78.6%, 15 (21.4%) respondents marked that the MNAs and MPAs do not want to transfer funds to local level, similarly 5 (7.1%) respondents considered the reason of financial constraints the bureaucracy, 5 (7.1%) respondents were in the favor that being part of opposition they are facing financial problems, 25 (35.7%) respondents believed that the provincial government is not interested to transfer funds to local level that is why we are facing financial constraints while 5 (7.1%) respondents stated that the political intervention as the

reason of financial constraints to local body elected members. Majority of the respondents (35.7%) were of that the provincial governments do not want to transfer the funds to local level that is why there is financial constraints. The mean of the above data is 2.36, median of the data is 2.50 while 4 is the mode of the data. The table has been also tested with Chi-Square test and the result has been presented the below table.

Test Statistics

	Financial constraints to elected local body members
Chi-Square	28.571^a
Df	5
Asymp. Sig.	.000

a. 0 cells (0.0%) have expected frequencies less than 5. The minimum expected cell frequency is 11.7.

The table mentioned shows the results of Chi-Square test. The results of the test indicate with the Chi-Square value of 28.571a, degree of freedom 5 while $p < 0.5$ shows significant relations in Financial constraints to elected local body members.

1.6.5. Lack of Rule of Law

The constitution of Pakistan is the most valid and perfect constitution in the whole world. But still there is lack of rule of law. The main reasons of this are the no proper implementation of the constitution in the country and about all the agencies fail to implement this. In every sphere of life there is lack of rule of law. The researcher included Question about the lack of rule of law to know about the opinion of the respondents in this regard. The various aspect of lack of rule of law have been analyzed and presented in the Table-5 below.

Table-5: Lack of Rule of Law

Lack of rule and law	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent	Mean	Median	Mode
No	17	24.3	24.3			
People do not obey rule and law	25	35.7	60.0			
Intervention of high rank officers	6	8.6	68.6	1.47	1.00	1
People are not aware about the rule and law	22	31.4	100.0			
Total	70	100.0				

In this context the statistical data shows the results of the opinions of the respondents about the lack of rule of law. Among the total numbers of the respondents 17 (24.3%) respondents marked that there is no lack of rule of law and everything is about the rule and law while 53 (76.7%) were of the views that there is lack of rule of law. Among the 76.7% respondents, 25 (35.7%) respondents were of the opinion that there is lack of rule of law because the people do not obey rule and law, similarly 6 (8.6%) respondents believed that there is lack of rule of law because of the intervention of high rank officers while 22 (31.4%) respondents stated that there is lack of rule and law which is due to lack of awareness among the people about the rule and law. Majority of the respondents (35.7%) were in the favor that people do not obey the rule and law as the main reason of lack of rule and law. The mean of the data which is given in the above data is 1.47, median of the data is 1.00 while the mode of the data is 1. The tabular data has been also tested with Chi-Square Test and the result of the test has been given in the mentioned table

Test Statistics	
	Lack of rule of law
Chi-Square	11.943 ^a
Df	3
Asymp. Sig.	.008

a. 0 cells (0.0%) have expected frequencies less than 5. The minimum expected cell frequency is 17.5.

Chi-Square test has been used to judge the association of variables. Test statistics chi-Square with value 11.943a, degree of freedom= 3 and with $p > 0.05$ shows that there is no significance relations in the Lack of rule of law.

1.6.6. Lack of Awareness about Local Government System, Concept and Working

The concept of local government is not new in Pakistan but it is not regularly practice in the country. The current local government system came after about 14 years. Most of the people were not aware that how to work and also do not know this system. That is why majority of the local body members were facing problems due to lack of awareness. The researcher asked in this regard from the respondents about the lack of awareness about local government system, concept and working to judge the views of the filed participants. The various reasons of lack of awareness have been discussed and presented in the Table-6.

Table-6: Lack of Awareness about Local Government System, Concept and Working

Reasons of lack of awareness	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent	Mean	Median	Mode
No	10	14.3	14.3			
No awareness campaign	23	32.8	42.9			
No proper training	17	24.2	71.4	1.71	2.00	1a
No workshop	20	28.6	100.0			
Total	70	100.0				

The tabular data shows the results of the opinions of the respondents regarding the lack of awareness about local government system, concept and working. Among the total number of respondents, only 10 (14.3%) respondents believed that there is no lack of awareness about local government system, concept and working and they are well aware about this system while 60 (85.7%) respondents was of the views that there is lack of awareness regarding local body system, concept and working. Among the 85.7%, 23 (32.8%) respondents were of the opinions that there is no awareness campaign regarding local body system, concept and working, similarly 17 (24.2%) respondents stated that there is no proper training about the local body government system, concept and working while also the 20 (28.6%) respondents were in the favor that there is no workshop regarding this system. Majority of the respondents (32.8%) were of the opinion that there is no awareness campaign regarding the local body government system, concept and working. The mean of the above data is 1.71, the median is 2.00 while the mode of the data is 1a while the test statistics in the form of Chi-Square test has been used for the given data and the result of the test has been presented in the following table.

Test Statistics

	Lack of awareness about local Government system, concept and working
Chi-Square	4.286 ^a
Df	3
Asymp. Sig.	.232

a. 0 cells (0.0%) have expected frequencies less than 5. The minimum expected cell frequency is 17.5.

The given test statistics i.e. chi-Square with value 4.286a, degree of freedom= 3 and with $p > 0.05$ shows that there is no significance relation in Lack of awareness about local Government system, concept and working.

1.7. DISCUSSION OVER FINDINGS

The existence of local body government is very important for strengthening the process of democracy, solving the problem on local basis and for the development of society. The establishment of democratic institutions at grass root level like local body government is a basic requirement for the welfare of society. The study Provincial governments not only are reluctant to conduct local bodies' elections but have failed to transfer finances and human resources to local level. In developed democracies local governments are real responsible for municipal services, but in Pakistan right now these representative institutions don't exist. In many areas, there is a lack of adequate funds, infrastructure and insufficient qualified and trained administration as well as staff. Local government will encounter serious difficulties in delivering efficient services if it does not have the necessary financial, capacity and other resources. Lack of resources and powerlessness remain the two big challenges in local

development. The financial, constraint is one of the main causes for the poor performance of most municipal governments. The study further expounds that the influence and interference of Bureaucracy is also a big challenge in the way of free and efficient local government in Pakistan. Sometime the projects of great importance are delayed due to red tape. It has been a common practice that Bureaucrats often used their influence to keep the locally elected bodies on back footings. Pakistan's centralized system is not delivering because officials who work for federal and provincial governments do not have the necessary knowledge of local conditions to provide efficient government. In this centralized system governmental activities at the local level are not driven by demand but pushed from the center to the local level and people do not feel any ownership.

1.8. CONCLUSION

The current study explored the different problems faced by local body members in the District Dir Lower, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. The study expounds that majority of the local body members belonged to Jammata e Islami and having strong inspiration to solve the problems of local community. Regarding bureaucratic hurdle major of the respondents (local body members) were in the favor that bureaucrats delay the work of local body members. The study further indicates and summaries that most of the local body members stated that there is lack of infrastructure and it is due to less interest of the provincial government. The study with regard to the war on terror most of the field participant (local body members) consider war on terror as problem to elected local body members while in regard of lack of rule of law, the study shows that majority of the local body members believed that there is lack of rule of law and it is due to people which do not obey the rule and law. Similarly, the study further indicates that most of the local body members stated there is lack of awareness about local body system, concept and working which is due to no awareness campaign regarding local body system

while the study summaries that majority of field participants were of the opinion that there is financial constraint which is due to provincial government.

1.9. RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the data obtained from the field, their analysis and statistical conclusion with theoretical discussion, the researchers recommend the following recommendations:

- ❖ The study confirms that there is lack of awareness regarding the local body system, concept and working. In this regard, it is suggested that the provincial Khyber Pakhtunkhwa government should arrange special training workshops and seminars and arrange awareness campaign in every union council regarding local body system.
- ❖ Similarly, the analysis shows that local body members faced problems from the provincial government. In this regard, it is suggested that provincial government should eliminate all the problems in the way of local body members and transfer authority to the local body members and should bring the district bureaucrats under the District Nazim Ala.
- ❖ In last the it is suggested that the federal government and all the provincial government should make proper legislation and amendments in the constitution for regular local body elections after three years.

REFERENCES

- Ahmed, V., & Amjad, R. (1984). *The Management of Pakistan's Economy, 1947-82*. Oxford University Press. Bhatti, A. (2013).
Deconstructing Article 140 (A). Islamabad: United Nations Development Program (UNDP).
Hamid, S. (2010). *Impact of 18th Amendment on Federal-Provinces Relations*. Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency (PILDAT).

- Jalal, A. (1995). *Democracy and Authoritarianism in Pakistan: A Comparative and Historical Perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Khan, Z. (2013). *Post 18th Amendment of the Constitution of Pakistan: A Critical Appraisal*". Islamabad: Strengthening Participatory Organization (SPO).
- Mathur, K. (1983). *Administrative Decentralization in Asia*. In G. S. Cheema, & D. A. Rodonelli (Eds.), *Decentralization and Development: Policy Implementations in Developing Countries* (pp. 59-76).
- Pakistan Reforming Provincial Finances in the Context of Devolution: An Eight Point Agenda*. Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Unit South Asia Region, 2008.
- Rizvi, S. A. (1976). *Changing Patterns of Local Government in Pakistan*. Pakistan Historical Society.
- Smith, B. C. (1985). *Decentralization: The Territorial Dimension of the State*. London: George Allan and Unwin.
- Talbot, I. (2009). *Pakistan: A Modern History*. London: C Hurst & Company Publishers Limited.
- Turner, M., & Hulme, D. (1997). *Governance, Administration and Development: Making the State Work*. West Hartford: Kumarian Press. 34
- Waseem, M. (2007). *Politics and the State in Pakistan*. Islamabad: National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research, Centre of Excellence, Quaid-i-Azam University.
- Waseem, M. (2010). *Federalism in Pakistan*. Lahore: Lahore University of Management Sciences.
- Wilder, A. (1999). *The Pakistani Voter: Electoral Politics and Voting Behavior in Punjab*. Oxford University Press. World Bank. (2000).